



**York Historical Architectural Review Board  
Meeting Minutes  
January 22, 2015**

Members in attendance included John Fox, Chair; Dennis Kunkle, Vice Chair; W. Craig Zumbrun; Mark Shermeyer; Dave Redshaw, Justine Landis and Robin Pottorff

Absent: Teresa Johnescu and Matt Argabright

Consultant: Roger Ciuffo, Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant, Historic York, Inc.

AGENDA ITEM	DISCUSSION	ACTION/RESULT
<b>Welcome and call to order John Fox, Chair</b>	The meeting was called to order at 6:00 pm.  The agenda had been prepared by HYI board members and City Staff.	A quorum was present.
<b>Changes to the Agenda</b>	There were no changes to the agenda.	
<b>Minutes of November 13, 2014</b>	No errors or omissions were noted	On a motion by Dennis Kunkle, seconded by Dave Redshaw, the Board voted unanimously to approve the November 13, 2014 minutes.
<b>Cases</b>	The following cases are forwarded to York City council with the recommended actions.	

**Case #1 - 223 North George Street**

The Elks Lodge is proposing to update the deteriorated concrete sidewalk on the south side of their building leading from the rear parking lot to the handicap ramp entrance. They are also proposing to remove the existing wood handicap ramp and replace it with a wider version constructed with composite decking boards to match the brick façade of the building. The small shed roof porch above the entry door will also be replaced and extended to match the end of the ramp to protect the members from the elements.

**Minutes:** On a motion by Dave Redshaw, seconded by Mark Shermeyer, the Board voted unanimously to approve this project with one amendment.\*

\*Amendment – Craig Zumbrun voted to approve the project with one exception the porch supports need to be sleeved or stained to match the brick facade. Cedar may be used but must also be stained or painted to match the brick facade.

There was discussion on the material being used for the decking and railings for the new handicap ramp. The applicant noted that the material would be a composite material which will be used for the decking and the railing. Board members suggested that the composite material be textured. The new deck, ramp and railings would be constructed using pressure treated limber and then covered with the composite material.

Dave Redshaw impressed the importance in making sure that ALL aspects of the ramp and railings were ADA compliant.

John Fox and Dave Redshaw requested that the 4"x4" posts that will be used for the new extended roof supports be place on footers to save them from water damage and early deterioration. It was also discussed that cedar wood may be used for the posts but must also be stained or painted to match the brick facade.

It was also agreed upon that the new decking and ramp composite materials be red in color to match the brick façade of the building.

## **Case #2 - 109 West Gay Avenue**

The applicants are planning a complete renovation of the former Keystone Colors Works building located at 109 West Gay Avenue into 29 apartments. The building is located in the Northwest Triangle area of the City at the corner of West Gay Avenue and North Beaver Street. The renovation requires the replacement of all of the windows and the reopening of windows that have been bricked over. Some doors into the building are also missing or in disrepair and will need to be replaced. Some of the door openings have been bricked over and the applicant proposes to insert windows and smaller doors into those openings on the east façade of the building.

The applicant will also be installing vertical metal siding on some of the door openings and on the proposed roof deck. The applicant also will be cleaning the brick and repointing where needed. There is a mural on the west elevation stating the name if the company "Keystone Color Works Inc." this will be retained and restored.

**Minutes:** On a motion by Craig Zumbrun, seconded by Robyn Pottorff, the Board voted 6 to 1\* to approve the project as submitted with one amendment. \*\*

\*Dave Redshaw was the dissenting vote noting he does not approve of vinyl windows.

\*\*Amendment – The Board requested to see a sample of the vertical metal siding that will be used on portions of the building. The applicant will bring said samples to Historic York for HARB Board members to stop and review. This will not affect the project approval.

The main discussion for this project revolved around the extensive window replacement on this building. There are numerous windows of varying sizes, all are in a state of disrepair due to neglect over the years. The applicant proposed to replace the existing windows with solid vinyl windows (1/1, 9/9, 12/12 – all have internal grids). They brought a sample along for display.

Craig Zumbrun and Dave Redshaw voiced their opposition for the vinyl windows. Zumbrun noted that he has used vinyl windows in past projects and that his experience has shown that windows with a southern exposure significantly warped making the windows inoperable. He noted that “vinyl doesn’t hold up to time.”

The applicants voiced their concern about the cost of repair than replace and noted that it would not be cost effective to pursue rehabilitation of the building if the vinyl would not be approved. They also noted the window manufacturer MI Windows & Doors offered a lifetime warranty on the chosen window which appeased some of the Board members. They also noted several other projects that they have completed using vinyl windows and all have held up so far (1360 North George Street, 815 North George Street and the Carriage Works apartments on West Market Street).

Dave Redshaw was still in opposition as he thought the windows should be repaired than replaced with vinyl.

Mark Shermeyer asked staff his opinion on the vinyl windows; staff noted that if you look around the area of this building you can see vinyl windows already in place, so introducing vinyl to this building would not introduce something new to the area. He also noted that the Board should consider that this building has been sitting vacant for many years and that a compromise (allowing vinyl) should be considered to get this building put back to use. We need to look at the importance of incorporating historic preservation and economic development to reach a final goal that meets everyone’s needs.

Staff also noted that he visited another project that the applicants completed, 1360 North George Street using the same windows. He noted that it was difficult to tell that those windows were vinyl.

The applicant also noted that they will reopen the numerous bricked in windows most prominent on the eastern façade of the building.

Other areas of discussion revolved around inserting new doors and windows where they do not currently exist. The applicant noted that they were needed as a second form of egress from the building for the tenants because the west elevation of the buildings abuts railroad tracks. The tenants need a safe exit. The Board agreed. The applicants noted that the existing doors on the west façade will be clad with vertical metal siding. By not removing the doors, cladding them with siding, you will be able to see the original openings on this building. Also, a new window will be placed in the transoms allowing for natural light to enter the proposed apartment.

John Fox had questions on the proposed vertical metal siding that was chosen to be placed in certain areas of the building, i.e. existing doors and the proposed roof deck. The applicant only brought a small sample for review, Fox noted that this was too small for the Board to make a decision on and asked for a larger sample. The applicant will be bringing a sample to Historic York’s office for Board members to stop and review.

The applicants also proposed a small roof deck that all tenants could access. Visibility was an issue with the Board. The applicants also noted you could not see the proposed deck when you are standing by the building. The Board noted that although the roof deck would not be visible from within close proximity to the building, it would be possibly visible from a distance away. The Board wanted to make sure that the chosen material would not “standout” to much, hence the request by Fox that a larger sample of the siding be available for the Board to view.

**Adjourning and next meeting**

**The meeting was adjourned by common consent at 6:55 pm. The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday February 12, 2015.**

**Other business**

- **Nominations will be accepted for a new HARB Board chair – John Fox asked to be removed from the Chair position.**
- **Nominations will be accepted for the replacement of Genevieve Ray who resigned from the Board in November 2014.**
- **Historic York, Inc. will be holding a Lunch & Learn session on Tuesday February 24<sup>th</sup> titled “Reviving the Lost Art of Moldings.” The cost is free to HARB Board members as this can be used to meet part of the required 8 hours of educational training per year.**

Discussion pertaining to the HARB Board members was Tabled for discussion until the February 12, 2015 meeting.

HARB Board members were informed of this event and that it will be counted towards the required 8 hours of educational training per year if they choose to attend.

**Minutes recorded by Roger Ciuffo, Architectural Historian/HARB Consultant, Historic York, Inc.**